

Fire & EMS Consolidation Planning Brief

Agency workbook and three-year call-data assessment for one town-wide fire district

Purpose and planning frame

This brief integrates the four Fire & EMS Agencies in Crisis workbooks supplied by Ron Graner with the Town's regional fire and EMS response analysis for calendar years 2023–2026 (2026 partial). It converts the reported governance, people, stations, apparatus, finances, demand, response performance, mutual aid, and coverage data into a preliminary consolidation work plan for Fayetteville, Manlius, Minoa, and the Kirkville Fire District. This remains a screening-level report—not a final feasibility study, tax plan, legal opinion, deployment plan, or labor-transition agreement.

Executive conclusion

The combined evidence supports moving into a structured feasibility and system-design phase, but it does not yet support a final vote on district boundaries, station deployment, staffing, apparatus reductions, or a uniform tax rate. Reported agency incident volume rose about 20% from 2023 to 2025; mutual and automatic aid are already embedded in routine operations; and 1,123 EMS home-area calls were covered through aid in 2025. The operational system is regional in practice but remains fragmented in governance, deployment, standards, workforce planning, and capital management.

Reported agency snapshot

Agency	Structure / stations	Reported active members*	Operating budget	Tax-base / rate data	Fleet listed
Fayetteville	Village / 1	81	\$3,582,128	\$1.411B / 2.539 mills	7
Manlius	Village / 1	66	\$4,481,479.86	\$2.315B / 1.870 mills	10
Minoa	Village / 2	37	\$2,274,631	\$1.115B combined / 2.039 planning mills ¹	7
Kirkville	Fire district / 1	22 (station count)	\$257,480	\$160.1M / 1.608 mills	5
Combined	4 entities / 5 stations	≈206	\$10,595,718.86	Scenario modeling still required	29

*Headline member counts are not fully comparable. Several sheets mix unique headcount with roles, credentials, sex, age, and employment status; those categories can overlap. Kirkville's headline cell is blank, so its current station count is shown.

What the snapshot says

- **Five existing stations** and 29 listed vehicles/apparatus create a meaningful service platform, but CAD/GIS travel-time analysis is still needed to test whether that footprint is optimally located and right-sized.
- **Known operating budgets** total about \$10.60 million; reported capital budgets add at least \$1.52 million, but definitions and fiscal periods must be normalized before aggregation.
- **Volunteer capacity** is uneven and time-dependent; career staffing is concentrated in Fayetteville and Manlius, while Minoa and Kirkville rely predominantly on volunteers.

¹ Onondaga County, 2026 Rate Book, p. 31 (Minoa Fire special district: \$847,501,761 taxable value, 1.6849 tax rate, and \$1,427,955.98 levy) and p. 5 (Village of Minoa: \$267,467,855 taxable value). The combined \$1,114,969,616 planning value is the sum of those two published values. The 2.0392-mill planning equivalent and \$611.76 example are calculations using the submitted \$2,274,631 operating budget; they are not currently levied rates. https://onondaga.gov/rpts/wp-content/uploads/sites/204/2026/02/2026_RateBook.pdf

Three-year demand and performance evidence

The call-data workbook reports agency-level incident records for 2023–2025 plus a partial 2026 period. Because a single emergency may generate records for more than one fire/EMS entity, totals below should be used as workload indicators—not assumed to be unique community emergencies—until event identifiers are deduplicated.

Entity	2023	2024	2025	2023–25	Median total	90th pct.
Kirkville Fire	148	158	168	+14%	9.25 min	13.03 min
Minoa Fire	439	541	617	+41%	7.20 min	12.32 min
Manlius Fire	668	799	1,075	+61%	5.12 min	8.73 min
Fayetteville Fire	754	796	1,041	+38%	4.98 min	8.33 min
Minoa EMS	1,592	1,764	1,838	+15%	7.55 min	13.13 min
Manlius EMS	1,732	1,905	1,876	+8%	6.17 min	12.97 min
Fayetteville EMS	2,281	2,405	2,496	+9%	5.17 min	10.25 min
Agency-record total	7,614	8,368	9,111	+20%	—	—

What the call data adds to the plan

Finding	Evidence	Planning implication
Demand is rising	Agency records increased from 7,614 in 2023 to 9,111 in 2025. Fire-department records rose 44%; EMS-agency records rose 11%.	Size the new organization for present demand plus growth—not a simple combination of current staffing and budgets.
Turnout is the largest fire-service variation	Median turnout: Kirkville 6.35 minutes; Minoa 2.27; Manlius 1.52; Fayetteville 1.53. Travel times are closer (3.17–4.17).	A town-wide duty-crew and closest-unit model could improve reliability more than boundary changes alone, especially where stations are not routinely staffed.
EMS capacity is interdependent	In 2025, aid covered 1,123 EMS home-area calls: Minoa 368 (20.0% of demand), Manlius 331 (17.6%), Fayetteville 424 (17.0%).	Model EMS as one capacity pool with dynamic posting, system status management, and common performance accountability.
Fayetteville is a major EMS backstop	The workbook identifies Fayetteville as the dominant outside responder into Minoa and Manlius; coverage is bidirectional, but tilted toward Fayetteville as a net provider.	Protect existing surge capacity while balancing workload, unit placement, and cost responsibility across the town.
Peak demand is predictable	System activity is highest roughly 09:00–19:00. Fire demand peaks later in the day; EMS maintains a broad daytime plateau.	Use time-of-day staffing and deployment rather than one static staffing assumption for all hours and stations.
High-load days are routine	Fayetteville EMS averaged 6.89 records/day and reached 17; Manlius EMS 5.27 and 16; Minoa EMS 4.95 and 15.	Test simultaneous-call coverage, unit-hour utilization, hospital turnaround, and reserve/recall triggers.

Response-standard caution

The workbook compares 90th-percentile results with a nine-minute career benchmark, while the system uses mixed career and volunteer models. The committee should not treat that reference as a final adopted standard. It should define risk-based, legally and operationally reviewed performance objectives for first unit, effective response force, EMS arrival, and transport capacity—and measure them town-wide and by service zone.

Operational assessment

Dimension	Workbook evidence	Consolidation implication
Staffing & availability	Fayetteville reports 24/7 career staffing (8 day/5 night) plus 3 volunteers at night. Manlius reports 5–6 career staff and 0–4 volunteers. Minoa HQ schedules 4 volunteers, 1800–2300; Station 2 shows no scheduled staffing. Kirkville reports no regular in-station schedule.	Build a town-wide minimum-staffing and dynamic deployment plan by hour/day; preserve volunteer participation while eliminating jurisdictional barriers.
Volunteer sustainability	Reported volunteers outside the district for work/school: Fayetteville 20, Minoa 24, Kirkville 17; Manlius did not complete the field. Minoa does not track availability; the others report that they do.	Use one availability/credential system, common duty crews, unified recruitment, and measurable turnout expectations.
Qualifications & fitness	Interior-qualified counts reported: Fayetteville 24, Minoa 22, Kirkville 8; Manlius certification/fitness fields are blank. EMS certification entries vary materially in completeness.	Validate unique qualified headcount, annual physicals, interior status, EMS level, driver/operator status, and officer credentials before designing staffing.
Stations	Fayetteville and Manlius are staffed 24/7. Minoa has two stations with different capabilities. Kirkville lacks bunk rooms and scheduled staffing. Manlius notes excellent training/bunk facilities but a location disadvantage for many calls.	Complete GIS/travel-time analysis before closing, relocating, or materially changing any station; identify headquarters, training, logistics, and satellite functions.
Fleet & capital	29 vehicles/apparatus are listed. Fayetteville and Manlius fleets are largely 2023–2025; Minoa is largely 2011–2021; Kirkville is 2000–2021. Replacement cost and lifecycle tabs are mostly incomplete.	Create one apparatus standard and 15–20 year replacement schedule; test reserve needs and specialty duplication against incident demand and ISO implications.
Demand & mutual aid	Agency records grew 20% from 2023 to 2025. Automatic aid is routine. Fire “aid received” is high because running cards dispatch multiple departments; EMS coverage data show 1,123 home-area calls covered by aid in 2025.	Develop a closest-appropriate-unit model, unified running cards, one performance dashboard, and a town-wide EMS capacity plan.

Material data limitations to resolve before modeling

- **Tax model:** The 2026 County Rate Book reports \$847,501,761 for the Minoa Fire Protection District outside the village and \$267,467,855 for the Village of Minoa, or \$1,114,969,616 combined. Applying Minoa’s submitted \$2,274,631 operating budget to that combined planning base produces an equivalent 2.0392 mills, or \$611.76 per \$300,000 of taxable value. This is a planning comparison—not a currently levied rate—because village and outside-village taxpayers fund service through different mechanisms. Kirkville’s average-home cells remain mis-entered, and a uniform town-wide rate still requires boundary-certified assessment, revenues, debt, reserves, capital, and transition costs.²
- **Budget model:** “operations,” “capital,” and “current-year budget” do not reconcile consistently; revenues, EMS billing, debt service, reserves, grants, fund balance, and village overhead allocations are incomplete.
- **People model:** role and demographic totals sometimes double-count the same individuals. Establish a de-identified personnel roster with one row per person and separate fields for status, credentials, availability, station, seniority, and bargaining unit.
- **Call-data model:** validate whether each row represents a unique incident, agency response, or unit response; reconcile fire and EMS records sharing one event; geocode incidents; and add unit-hour utilization, transport destination, hospital delay, cancellation, and effective-response-force measures.
- **Asset model:** require title/ownership, age, condition, debt, replacement year, maintenance cost, insurance, restrictions, and proposed transfer treatment for every station, vehicle, reserve, and major equipment item.

Preliminary planning principles

Design the new system around equal service expectations, risk and demand—not existing political boundaries. Keep response reliability and member safety ahead of short-term savings; consolidation can reduce duplication and improve coordination, but it may also reveal necessary

² Onondaga County, 2026 Rate Book, p. 31 (Minoa Fire special district: \$847,501,761 taxable value, 1.6849 tax rate, and \$1,427,955.98 levy) and p. 5 (Village of Minoa: \$267,467,855 taxable value). The combined \$1,114,969,616 planning value is the sum of those two published values. The 2.0392-mill planning equivalent and \$611.76 example are calculations using the submitted \$2,274,631 operating budget; they are not currently levied rates. https://onondaga.gov/rpts/wp-content/uploads/sites/204/2026/02/2026_RateBook.pdf

investments in staffing, facilities, technology, and capital reserves. Maintain transparent participation by village boards, the Town, Kirkville commissioners, career employees and their unions, volunteers, taxpayers, and EMS stakeholders.

Recommended consolidation work plan

Phase	Core work	Decision gate / deliverable
1. Validate baseline 0–60 days	Issue one data dictionary; reconcile workbooks to audited budgets, tax rolls, payroll/rosters, apparatus titles, station records, and contracts. Deduplicate CAD events, geocode calls, validate aid definitions, and resolve boundary/service-area maps.	Committee-approved “single source of truth,” exceptions log, and public-facing baseline report.
2. Define service standard 30–90 days	Adopt risk categories and performance targets; model call concurrency, travel time, turnout, first-unit and effective-response-force performance; define fire, rescue, and EMS expectations.	Service-level policy and gap analysis—before selecting staffing or station changes.
3. Design organization 60–120 days	Evaluate governance options, board composition, chief/command structure, volunteer-company relationships, policies, medical direction, dispatch, purchasing, IT, records, and public accountability.	Preferred governance and operating model with legal counsel’s implementation map.
4. Build workforce plan 75–150 days	Create unique personnel roster; model 24/7 staffing; bargain impacts; address civil service, seniority, wages/benefits, assignments, volunteer status, training, physicals, and cultural integration.	Staffing plan, labor strategy, credential transition plan, and recruitment/retention program.
5. Build financial & asset plan 90–180 days	Develop normalized operating/capital baseline; five-year forecast; tax-impact scenarios; EMS revenue; debt/reserves; asset valuation/transfer; station and apparatus lifecycle plan; transition costs and contingencies.	Preferred scenario with household examples, sensitivity tests, and independent fiscal review.
6. Decide, engage, implement 150+ days	Complete legal procedure, public engagement, resolutions/hearings/referendum analysis, agreements, policies, communications, command transition, procurement, and phased go-live with performance dashboard.	Approved implementation agreement, accountable transition team, milestones, and after-action reviews.

Governance and legal path

New York Town Law Article 11-A provides a framework for joint fire districts involving towns and villages. A New York State Comptroller opinion describes joint meetings, a joint public hearing, board resolutions subject to permissive referendum, dissolution of an existing fire protection district, potential transfer of village fire assets, and a three-to-seven-member board of commissioners that may be appointed or elected. Because this project involves three villages and an existing independent fire district, municipal counsel should confirm the exact sequence, boundary treatment, Kirkville transition, EMS authority, debt/asset treatment, labor obligations, and referendum requirements before the committee publishes a legal timetable.

Immediate committee actions

- **Adopt** the six-phase work plan and a rule that no station, staffing, apparatus, or tax conclusion will be presented as final until the common baseline is validated.
- **Direct** each agency and municipality to complete the missing-data register within 30 days, using the same definitions and fiscal period.
- **Commission** the CAD/GIS validation, deployment modeling, and fiscal analyses in parallel, with named leads and one shared repository.
- **Create** operational, workforce/labor, finance/assets, governance/legal, and public-engagement workgroups with cross-agency representation.
- **Publish** a short monthly dashboard: data completion, service-design progress, open decisions, risks, and upcoming participation opportunities.

Sources and use limitations

Primary local sources: the four agency workbooks supplied for Fayetteville, Manlius, Minoa, and Kirkville, plus “Muni – Town of Manlius FIRE AND EMS REPORT – 2023–2026” (2026 partial), reviewed July 19, 2026. Assessment source: Onondaga County, 2026 Rate Book, pp. 5 and 31, https://onondaga.gov/rpts/wp-content/uploads/sites/204/2026/02/2026_RateBook.pdf. Framework context: Ron Graner, *Fire & EMS Agencies in Crisis*, 2nd ed., public book description and author-provided workbook structure. Legal reference: NYS Office of the State Comptroller, Opinion 90-27, <https://www.osc.ny.gov/legal-opinions/opinion-90-27>; New York Town Law, Article 11-A, <https://www.nysenate.gov/legislation/laws/TWN>. Legal references are planning guidance only and require review by municipal counsel.